

City of North Muskegon ECF analysis: C1, M-120 COR/Whitehall Rd

Units Analyzed: (White River Twp, Montague Twp, Whitehall Twp, Blue Lake Twp, Holton Twp, Dalton Twp, Cedar Creek Twp, Laketon Twp, Muskegon Twp, Egelson Twp, Moorland Twp, Casnovia Twp, Fruitport Twp, Sullivan Twp, Ravenna Twp, City of Montague, City of White)

DATES ANALYZED: APRIL 1, 2022 - MARCH 31, 2024

PARCEL NUMBER	CLASS	ADDRESS	SALE DATE	SALE PRICE	ADJ SALE PRICE	PREV ASSESSMENT	PREV ASSESS/ADJ. SALE RATIO	CURRENT APPRAISAL	LAND + YARD IMPS	BUILDING RESIDUAL	CURRENT COST MANUAL	E.C.F.
21-161-011-0013-00	201	8875 WATER ST	07/20/23	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$86,100	57.40	\$185,190	\$74,081	\$75,919	\$138,886	0.547
07-681-011-0001-00	201	6110 HOLTON RD	05/12/23	\$90,000	\$90,000	\$49,400	54.89	\$120,988	\$18,765	\$71,235	\$129,396	0.551
02-016-400-0001-00	201	9760 US 31	04/29/22	\$580,000	\$580,000	\$353,400	60.93	\$767,050	\$126,894	\$453,106	\$800,195	0.566
09-255-000-0009-00	201	3738 W GILES RD	04/26/22	\$60,000	\$60,000	\$41,400	69.00	\$73,485	\$19,402	\$40,598	\$67,604	0.601
23-585-007-0017-00	201	1826 RUDDIMAN DR	10/24/22	\$105,000	\$105,000	\$83,600	79.62	\$122,630	\$50,419	\$54,581	\$90,264	0.605
02-016-200-0016-00	201	4051 FRUITVALE RD	09/01/22	\$325,000	\$325,000	\$178,000	54.77	\$399,160	\$59,228	\$265,772	\$424,915	0.625
22-220-016-0010-00	201	115 E COLBY ST	04/13/22	\$275,000	\$275,000	\$108,900	39.60	\$317,740	\$52,810	\$222,190	\$335,354	0.663
15-101-200-0019-00	201	2926 S MILL IRON RD	04/19/22	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$75,400	50.27	\$164,187	\$75,466	\$74,534	\$110,901	0.672
15-112-100-0026-00	201	3523 HTS RAVENNA RD	08/04/23	\$269,000	\$269,000	\$146,900	54.61	\$289,272	\$160,904	\$108,096	\$160,460	0.674
09-012-200-0030-00	201	1343 WHITEHALL RD	08/29/22	\$140,000	\$140,000	\$70,800	50.57	\$152,883	\$45,973	\$94,027	\$133,638	0.704
15-123-100-0013-00	201	5200 SHORT ST	07/27/22	\$175,000	\$175,000	\$79,100	45.20	\$181,298	\$123,470	\$51,530	\$72,285	0.713
21-161-013-0013-00	201	8725 WATER ST	01/26/23	\$120,000	\$120,000	\$50,400	42.00	\$127,773	\$44,259	\$75,741	\$105,714	0.716
10-007-100-0003-00	201	1362 WHITEHALL RD	06/07/22	\$235,000	\$235,000	\$146,600	62.38	\$247,100	\$73,482	\$161,518	\$217,023	0.744
21-021-100-0006-00	201	9300 WALSH RD	07/21/22	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$80,700	40.35	\$200,138	\$34,394	\$165,606	\$207,180	0.799
11-140-000-0003-00	201	5129 E APPLE AVE	06/17/22	\$115,000	\$115,000	\$54,400	47.30	\$113,960	\$45,705	\$69,295	\$85,319	0.812
15-111-200-0003-00	201	2901 HTS RAVENNA RD	10/07/22	\$127,000	\$127,000	\$64,500	50.79	\$121,035	\$34,065	\$92,935	\$110,089	0.844
10-005-400-0037-00	201	1509 HOLTON RD	08/05/22	\$357,250	\$357,250	\$155,000	43.39	\$329,556	\$97,897	\$259,353	\$289,574	0.896
09-001-200-0035-00	201	2165 WHITEHALL RD	06/15/22	\$290,000	\$290,000	\$86,100	29.69	\$277,269	\$176,213	\$113,787	\$126,320	0.901
11-021-100-0015-00	201	420 S WOLF LAKE RD	09/19/23	\$175,000	\$175,000	\$71,700	40.97	\$154,971	\$25,022	\$149,978	\$162,436	0.923
22-570-052-0003-00	201	511 E COLBY ST	04/15/22	\$325,000	\$325,000	\$114,200	35.14	\$276,927	\$72,588	\$252,412	\$255,424	0.988
15-017-200-0007-00	201	4289 S WOLF LAKE RD	09/14/23	\$315,000	\$315,000	\$102,300	32.48	\$263,472	\$50,854	\$264,146	\$265,773	0.994
02-016-100-0022-00	201	9801 US 31	10/31/23	\$605,000	\$605,000	\$220,100	36.38	\$485,150	\$70,457	\$534,543	\$518,366	1.031
22-220-029-0010-00	201	410 S LAKE ST	04/20/22	\$2,350,000	\$2,350,000	\$855,600	36.41	\$1,978,862	\$844,857	\$1,505,143	\$1,417,506	1.062
15-530-000-0009-00	201	3032 HTS RAVENNA RD	06/06/23	\$260,000	\$260,000	\$95,300	36.65	\$201,806	\$34,913	\$225,087	\$208,616	1.079
22-033-100-0036-00	201	115 W LEWIS ST	08/20/23	\$155,000	\$155,000	\$56,800	36.65	\$119,875	\$23,399	\$131,601	\$120,595	1.091
11-029-100-0009-00	201	4993 E APPLE AVE	07/13/22	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$84,000	37.33	\$175,666	\$53,823	\$171,177	\$152,304	1.124
07-600-000-0012-00	201	3345 WHITEHALL RD	07/20/22	\$429,900	\$429,900	\$141,600	32.94	\$315,708	\$74,493	\$355,407	\$305,335	1.164
13-002-400-0017-00	201	1547 NEWAYGO RD	03/15/24	\$300,000	\$300,000	\$100,900	33.63	\$209,992	\$77,971	\$222,029	\$165,026	1.345
Totals				\$8,903,150	\$8,903,150	\$3,753,200				\$6,261,346	\$7,176,497	
						Sales Ratio	42.16				ECF	0.87
											AVG ECF	0.84

CHANGE FROM 2024 TO 2025

Change from .80 to .87

28 commercial sales in time frame; indicated Commercial ECF of .87 is utilized, which is an upward adjustment from .80 in 2024.

City of North Muskegon ECF analysis: All Commercial Neighborhoods (C1, C2, C3, & C44)

Units Analyzed: (White River Twp, Montague Twp, Whitehall Twp, Blue Lake Twp, Holton Twp, Dalton Twp, Cedar Creek Twp, Laketon Twp, Muskegon Twp, Egelson Twp, Moorland Twp, Casnovia Twp, Fruitport Twp, Sullivan Twp, Ravenna Twp, City of Montague, City of Whitehall, City of North Muskegon)

DATES ANALYZED: APRIL 1, 2022 - MARCH 31, 2024

PARCEL NUMBER	CLASS	ADDRESS	SALE DATE	SALE PRICE	ADJ SALE PRICE	PREV ASSESSMENT	PREV ASSESS/ADJ. SALE RATIO	CURRENT APPRAISAL	LAND + YARD IMPS	BUILDING RESIDUAL	CURRENT COST MANUAL	E.C.F.
21-161-011-0013-00	201	8875 WATER ST	07/20/23	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$86,100	57.40	\$185,190	\$74,081	\$75,919	\$138,886	0.547
07-681-011-0001-00	201	6110 HOLTON RD	05/12/23	\$90,000	\$90,000	\$49,400	54.89	\$120,988	\$18,765	\$71,235	\$129,396	0.551
02-016-400-0001-00	201	9760 US 31	04/29/22	\$580,000	\$580,000	\$353,400	60.93	\$767,050	\$126,894	\$453,106	\$800,195	0.566
09-255-000-0009-00	201	3738 W GILES RD	04/26/22	\$60,000	\$60,000	\$41,400	69.00	\$73,485	\$19,402	\$40,598	\$67,604	0.601
23-585-007-0017-00	201	1826 RUDDIMAN DR	10/24/22	\$105,000	\$105,000	\$83,600	79.62	\$122,630	\$50,419	\$54,581	\$90,264	0.605
02-016-200-0016-00	201	4051 FRUITVALE RD	09/01/22	\$325,000	\$325,000	\$178,000	54.77	\$399,160	\$59,228	\$265,772	\$424,915	0.625
22-220-016-0010-00	201	115 E COLBY ST	04/13/22	\$275,000	\$275,000	\$108,900	39.60	\$317,740	\$52,810	\$222,190	\$335,354	0.663
15-101-200-0019-00	201	2926 S MILL IRON RD	04/19/22	\$150,000	\$150,000	\$75,400	50.27	\$164,187	\$75,466	\$74,534	\$110,901	0.672
15-112-100-0026-00	201	3523 HTS RAVENNA RD	08/04/23	\$269,000	\$269,000	\$146,900	54.61	\$289,272	\$160,904	\$108,096	\$160,460	0.674
09-012-200-0030-00	201	1343 WHITEHALL RD	08/29/22	\$140,000	\$140,000	\$70,800	50.57	\$152,883	\$45,973	\$94,027	\$133,638	0.704
15-123-100-0013-00	201	5200 SHORT ST	07/27/22	\$175,000	\$175,000	\$79,100	45.20	\$181,298	\$123,470	\$51,530	\$72,285	0.713
21-161-013-0013-00	201	8725 WATER ST	01/26/23	\$120,000	\$120,000	\$50,400	42.00	\$127,773	\$44,259	\$75,741	\$105,714	0.716
10-007-100-0003-00	201	1362 WHITEHALL RD	06/07/22	\$235,000	\$235,000	\$146,600	62.38	\$247,100	\$73,482	\$161,518	\$217,023	0.744
21-021-100-0006-00	201	9300 WALSH RD	07/21/22	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$80,700	40.35	\$200,138	\$34,394	\$165,606	\$207,180	0.799
11-140-000-0003-00	201	5129 E APPLE AVE	06/17/22	\$115,000	\$115,000	\$54,400	47.30	\$113,960	\$45,705	\$69,295	\$85,319	0.812
15-111-200-0003-00	201	2901 HTS RAVENNA RD	10/07/22	\$127,000	\$127,000	\$64,500	50.79	\$121,035	\$34,065	\$92,935	\$110,089	0.844
10-005-400-0037-00	201	1509 HOLTON RD	08/05/22	\$357,250	\$357,250	\$155,000	43.39	\$329,556	\$97,897	\$259,353	\$289,574	0.896
09-001-200-0035-00	201	2165 WHITEHALL RD	06/15/22	\$290,000	\$290,000	\$86,100	29.69	\$277,269	\$176,213	\$113,787	\$126,320	0.901
11-021-100-0015-00	201	420 S WOLF LAKE RD	09/19/23	\$175,000	\$175,000	\$71,700	40.97	\$154,971	\$25,022	\$149,978	\$162,436	0.923
22-570-052-0003-00	201	511 E COLBY ST	04/15/22	\$325,000	\$325,000	\$114,200	35.14	\$276,927	\$72,588	\$252,412	\$255,424	0.988
15-017-200-0007-00	201	4289 S WOLF LAKE RD	09/14/23	\$315,000	\$315,000	\$102,300	32.48	\$263,472	\$50,854	\$264,146	\$265,773	0.994
02-016-100-0022-00	201	9801 US 31	10/31/23	\$605,000	\$605,000	\$220,100	36.38	\$485,150	\$70,457	\$534,543	\$518,366	1.031
22-220-029-0010-00	201	410 S LAKE ST	04/20/22	\$2,350,000	\$2,350,000	\$855,600	36.41	\$1,978,862	\$844,857	\$1,505,143	\$1,417,506	1.062
15-530-000-0009-00	201	3032 HTS RAVENNA RD	06/06/23	\$260,000	\$260,000	\$95,300	36.65	\$201,806	\$34,913	\$225,087	\$208,616	1.079
22-033-100-0036-00	201	115 W LEWIS ST	08/20/23	\$155,000	\$155,000	\$56,800	36.65	\$119,875	\$23,399	\$131,601	\$120,595	1.091
11-029-100-0009-00	201	4993 E APPLE AVE	07/13/22	\$225,000	\$225,000	\$84,000	37.33	\$175,666	\$53,823	\$171,177	\$152,304	1.124
07-600-000-0012-00	201	3345 WHITEHALL RD	07/20/22	\$429,900	\$429,900	\$141,600	32.94	\$315,708	\$74,493	\$355,407	\$305,335	1.164
13-002-400-0017-00	201	1547 NEWAYGO RD	03/15/24	\$300,000	\$300,000	\$100,900	33.63	\$209,992	\$77,971	\$222,029	\$165,026	1.345
Totals				\$8,903,150	\$3,753,200					\$6,261,346	\$7,176,497	
						Sales Ratio	42.16				ECF	0.87
											AVG ECF	0.84

CHANGE FROM 2024 TO 2025
Change from .80 to .87

28 commercial sales in time frame; indicated Commercial ECF of .87 is utilized, which is an upward adjustment from .80 in 2024.

City of North Muskegon Industrial ECF Analysis

Units Analyzed: Muskegon County Wide

PARCEL NUMBER	SALE PRICE	ADJ SALE PRICE	BUILDING RESIDUAL	CURRENT COST MANUAL	E.C.F.	COST MANUEL X CALC'D ECF
27-104-100-0017-00	\$95,000	\$95,000	\$79,366	\$93,458	0.849	\$95,327
24-694-000-0041-00	\$375,000	\$375,000	\$263,856	\$274,837	0.960	\$280,334
24-205-098-0001-20	\$500,000	\$500,000	\$395,643	\$392,718	1.007	\$400,572
27-676-000-0023-00	\$1,090,000	\$1,090,000	\$969,068	\$941,500	1.029	\$960,330
11-031-200-0020-00	\$350,000	\$350,000	\$246,899	\$216,029	1.143	\$220,350
Totals		\$2,410,000	\$1,954,832	\$1,918,541		
				ECF	1.02	
				AVG ECF	1.00	

RESULTS	
Industrial ECF	1.02

Analysis of 5 Industrial Sales in multiple units within the County resulted in an ECF of 1.02 being used for 2025 for North Muskegon.

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R1 - Muskegon Lake Ftg

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-342-001-0006-00	10/14/22	\$605,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$605,000	\$369,158	\$235,842	\$182,264	1.294	R1
23-544-002-0008-00	03/01/24	\$825,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$825,000	\$532,334	\$292,666	\$223,084	1.312	R1
23-145-002-0001-70	12/01/23	\$700,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$700,000	\$206,511	\$493,489	\$302,261	1.633	R1
Totals:		\$2,130,000			\$2,130,000		\$1,021,997	\$707,609		
									E.C.F. =>	1.444
									Ave. E.C.F. =>	1.413

Indicated ECF of 1.444 was used.

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R2 Bear Lake Ftg

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area	
23-382-000-0002-00	07/03/23	\$950,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$950,000	\$407,583	\$542,417	\$428,527	1.266	R2	
23-262-000-0003-00	07/25/22	\$1,025,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$1,025,000	\$552,009	\$472,991	\$367,080	1.289	R2	
23-168-071-0002-70	10/25/23	\$599,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$599,000	\$307,988	\$291,012	\$185,853	1.566	R2	
Totals:		\$2,574,000			\$2,574,000		\$1,306,420	\$981,460			
									E.C.F. =>	1.331	0.1670527
									Ave. E.C.F. =>	1.373	59.2363

Indicated ECF of 1.331 was used.

Repeat Sale

23-168-071-0002-70	09/01/22	\$550,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$550,000	\$307,988	\$242,012	\$184,506	1.312	R2
--------------------	----------	-----------	----	-----------------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-------	----

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R3 Average Subs West

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-262-000-0044-00	08/18/22	\$206,700	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$206,700	\$31,168	\$175,532	\$121,190	1.448	R3
23-145-001-0010-00	02/27/23	\$259,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$259,900	\$34,064	\$225,836	\$155,825	1.449	R3
23-262-000-0104-00	03/30/23	\$392,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$392,000	\$36,191	\$355,809	\$237,057	1.501	R3
23-262-000-0025-00	05/31/23	\$245,500	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$245,500	\$30,114	\$215,386	\$142,559	1.511	R3
23-422-015-0005-00	11/10/22	\$220,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$220,000	\$27,140	\$192,860	\$125,746	1.534	R3
23-262-000-0099-00	05/16/23	\$390,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$390,000	\$33,344	\$356,656	\$231,459	1.541	R3
23-422-009-0010-00	07/05/22	\$202,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$202,000	\$27,140	\$174,860	\$109,273	1.600	R3
23-262-000-0088-00	08/30/22	\$380,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$380,000	\$31,405	\$348,595	\$214,905	1.622	R3
23-423-013-0005-00	05/11/22	\$165,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$165,000	\$27,140	\$137,860	\$83,446	1.652	R3
23-262-000-0042-00	08/21/23	\$234,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$234,900	\$31,168	\$203,732	\$120,454	1.691	R3
23-572-000-0010-00	05/16/22	\$202,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$202,000	\$30,000	\$172,000	\$100,668	1.709	R3
23-262-000-0029-00	10/06/23	\$360,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$360,000	\$50,265	\$309,735	\$180,836	1.713	R3
23-422-008-0005-00	06/09/22	\$300,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$300,000	\$31,219	\$268,781	\$156,411	1.718	R3
23-262-000-0083-10	04/21/22	\$256,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$256,000	\$26,686	\$229,314	\$133,096	1.723	R3
23-544-001-0018-00	03/29/23	\$660,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$660,000	\$34,000	\$626,000	\$359,933	1.739	R3
23-423-014-0008-00	11/04/22	\$267,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$267,000	\$27,219	\$239,781	\$136,020	1.763	R3
23-262-000-0095-00	02/16/24	\$218,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$218,000	\$27,140	\$190,860	\$107,159	1.781	R3
23-422-010-0010-00	04/27/22	\$250,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$250,000	\$32,235	\$217,765	\$121,826	1.788	R3
23-422-015-0004-00	05/18/22	\$258,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$258,000	\$27,140	\$230,860	\$125,549	1.839	R3
23-572-000-0019-00	09/12/22	\$289,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$289,900	\$34,469	\$255,431	\$138,242	1.848	R3
23-423-013-0012-00	08/09/23	\$340,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$340,000	\$41,035	\$298,965	\$160,099	1.867	R3
23-422-015-0008-00	04/26/22	\$189,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$189,900	\$27,732	\$162,168	\$85,221	1.903	R3
23-422-015-0009-00	12/28/22	\$159,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$159,900	\$27,140	\$132,760	\$68,849	1.928	R3
23-548-000-0028-00	12/07/22	\$370,500	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$370,500	\$31,872	\$338,628	\$166,435	2.035	R3
23-545-001-0004-00	12/15/23	\$449,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$449,900	\$34,596	\$415,304	\$203,651	2.039	R3
23-262-000-0102-00	12/14/23	\$350,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$350,000	\$35,710	\$314,290	\$151,487	2.075	R3
23-422-008-0012-00	10/05/23	\$251,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$251,900	\$27,290	\$224,610	\$107,803	2.084	R3
23-262-000-0012-00	04/29/22	\$250,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$250,000	\$27,602	\$222,398	\$106,250	2.093	R3
23-422-013-0005-00	06/29/22	\$275,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$275,000	\$31,359	\$243,641	\$114,737	2.123	R3
23-544-001-0016-00	05/16/23	\$602,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$602,900	\$34,259	\$568,641	\$265,701	2.140	R3
23-445-000-0038-00	09/21/23	\$290,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$290,000	\$27,236	\$262,764	\$120,223	2.186	R3
23-262-000-0090-00	11/04/22	\$249,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$249,000	\$28,743	\$220,257	\$99,589	2.212	R3
23-423-016-0012-00	06/29/23	\$175,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$175,000	\$27,677	\$147,323	\$66,540	2.214	R3
23-145-001-0003-00	06/15/23	\$298,500	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$298,500	\$30,513	\$267,987	\$120,305	2.228	R3
23-445-000-0051-00	03/21/24	\$279,900	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$279,900	\$27,585	\$252,315	\$109,578	2.303	R3
Totals:		\$10,289,300		\$10,289,300		\$9,199,704	\$5,048,122		
							E.C.F. =>	1.822	
							Ave. E.C.F. =>	1.846	

Based on analysis of sales in time period, Indicated ECF of 1.822 was used.

Repeat Sales

23-262-000-0104-00	04/18/22	\$372,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$372,000	\$36,191	\$335,809	\$237,057	1.417	R3
23-445-000-0051-00	07/28/23	\$250,000	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$250,000	\$27,585	\$222,415	\$109,578	2.030	R3

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R3A - Average Subs East

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area	
23-542-001-0001-00	07/06/22	\$220,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$220,000	\$18,994	\$201,006	\$138,507	1.451	R3A	
23-585-024-0001-30	09/22/22	\$219,900	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$219,900	\$24,365	\$195,535	\$133,163	1.468	R3A	
23-585-022-0005-00	09/05/23	\$250,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$250,000	\$30,563	\$219,437	\$147,950	1.483	R3A	
23-585-004-0007-00	04/11/23	\$228,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$228,000	\$22,000	\$206,000	\$136,925	1.504	R3A	
23-585-006-0013-00	08/30/23	\$290,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$290,000	\$23,302	\$266,698	\$172,857	1.543	R3A	
23-585-006-0006-00	04/29/22	\$270,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$270,000	\$21,366	\$248,634	\$160,706	1.547	R3A	
23-168-049-0001-60	06/12/23	\$170,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$170,000	\$18,546	\$151,454	\$92,978	1.629	R43	
23-168-049-0001-50	09/08/23	\$182,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$182,000	\$25,923	\$156,077	\$92,192	1.693	R43	
23-585-005-0011-00	05/06/22	\$210,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$210,000	\$19,270	\$190,730	\$112,493	1.695	R3A	
23-585-007-0007-00	09/21/22	\$182,450	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$182,450	\$23,017	\$159,433	\$86,238	1.849	R3A	
23-585-010-0006-00	12/07/23	\$208,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$208,000	\$23,341	\$184,659	\$98,934	1.866	R3A	
23-585-016-0005-00	02/15/23	\$170,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$170,000	\$18,000	\$152,000	\$79,408	1.914	R3A	
23-585-004-0010-00	06/07/22	\$242,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$242,000	\$21,188	\$220,812	\$114,741	1.924	R3A	
23-585-015-0011-00	01/31/23	\$135,500	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$135,500	\$18,410	\$117,090	\$57,115	2.050	R3A	
23-585-007-0010-00	10/11/23	\$245,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$245,000	\$20,148	\$224,852	\$109,401	2.055	R3A	
23-585-006-0020-00	07/11/23	\$224,800	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$224,800	\$21,270	\$203,530	\$96,716	2.104	R3A	
23-585-012-0007-00	08/15/22	\$190,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$190,000	\$21,188	\$168,812	\$80,143	2.106	R3A	
23-570-005-0019-00	02/21/24	\$245,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$245,000	\$21,765	\$223,235	\$104,427	2.138	R3A	
23-570-006-0009-00	12/22/22	\$155,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$155,000	\$21,116	\$133,884	\$62,446	2.144	R3A	
23-542-010-0009-00	03/07/24	\$202,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$202,000	\$21,901	\$180,099	\$83,861	2.148	R3A	
23-585-018-0022-00	08/05/22	\$230,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$230,000	\$20,000	\$210,000	\$97,505	2.154	R3A	
23-570-003-0004-00	08/22/22	\$157,500	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$157,500	\$18,000	\$139,500	\$63,056	2.212	R3A	
23-585-023-0004-10	11/23/22	\$172,500	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$172,500	\$21,560	\$150,940	\$66,969	2.254	R3A	
23-585-013-0003-00	07/28/23	\$255,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$255,000	\$23,188	\$231,812	\$102,200	2.268	R3A	
23-570-007-0001-00	12/29/23	\$212,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$208,000	\$20,000	\$188,000	\$81,541	2.306	R3A	
23-585-007-0012-00	01/24/23	\$320,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$320,000	\$25,235	\$294,765	\$126,751	2.326	R3A	
23-570-006-0019-00	06/14/23	\$234,900	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$234,900	\$22,277	\$212,623	\$90,314	2.354	R3A	
23-585-018-0007-00	08/31/22	\$245,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$245,000	\$22,000	\$223,000	\$94,271	2.366	R3A	
23-585-016-0011-00	06/10/22	\$260,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$260,000	\$18,000	\$242,000	\$102,135	2.369	R3A	
					\$6,322,550			\$5,696,617	\$2,985,943		
									E.C.F. =>	1.908	
									Ave. E.C.F. =>	1.963	

Based on analysis of sales in time period, Indicated ECF of 1.908 was used.

Repeat Sales

23-585-007-0012-00	05/06/22	\$220,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$220,000	\$25,235	\$194,765	\$126,751	1.537	R3A
--------------------	----------	-----------	----	-----------------	-----------	----------	-----------	-----------	-------	-----

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R4 - West of Channel

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-582-000-0014-00	08/29/23	\$260,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$260,000	\$35,524	\$224,476	\$124,589	1.802	R4
23-128-000-0091-00	02/21/23	\$200,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$200,000	\$30,000	\$170,000	\$94,150	1.806	R4
23-482-000-0007-00	03/01/23	\$255,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$255,000	\$32,547	\$222,453	\$118,317	1.880	R29
23-582-000-0020-00	01/25/23	\$256,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$256,000	\$27,818	\$228,182	\$116,927	1.951	R4
23-342-002-0005-00	04/28/22	\$236,100	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$236,100	\$31,845	\$204,255	\$104,472	1.955	R4
23-582-000-0037-00	08/14/23	\$221,100	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$221,100	\$27,188	\$193,912	\$97,585	1.987	R4
Totals:		\$1,428,200			\$1,428,200		\$1,243,278	\$656,040	E.C.F. => 1.895	
									Ave. E.C.F. => 1.897	

After analysis of sales, the Indicated ECF of 1.895 was used for 2025.

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R5 - East of Channel

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-382-000-0009-00	06/07/23	\$392,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$392,000	\$74,298	\$317,702	\$182,806	1.738	R5
23-382-000-0011-00	07/20/23	\$390,500	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$390,500	\$71,585	\$318,915	\$178,422	1.787	R5
23-382-000-0007-00	08/28/23	\$360,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$360,000	\$71,716	\$288,284	\$156,867	1.838	R5
23-304-000-0065-00	10/26/23	\$477,900	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$477,900	\$73,618	\$404,282	\$212,170	1.905	R5
Totals:		\$1,620,400			\$1,620,400		\$1,329,183	\$730,266	E.C.F. => 1.820	
									Ave. E.C.F. => 1.817	

After analysis of sales during current timeframe, the Indicated ECF of 1.820 was used for 2025.

Repeat Sales

23-304-000-0065-00	12/09/22	\$279,900	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$279,900	\$73,618	\$206,282	\$212,170	0.972	R5
--------------------	----------	-----------	----	-----------------	-----------	----------	-----------	-----------	-------	----

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R7 Channel Point/Bay Ridge Condos

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-130-000-0006-00	10/31/23	\$402,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$402,000	\$43,759	\$358,241	\$205,797	1.741	R7
23-161-000-0003-00	01/30/24	\$430,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$430,000	\$62,934	\$367,066	\$151,666	2.420	R9
Totals:		\$402,000			\$402,000		\$725,307	\$357,463	E.C.F. => 2.029	
									Ave. E.C.F. => 2.080	33.9739

Due to analysis of sales in recent timeframe, an Indicated ECF of 2.029 was used for 2025.

Outside Units Analyzed: City of Norton Shores; City of Roosevelt Park;

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
25-480-000-0013-00	08/25/23	\$218,999	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$218,999	\$21,174	\$197,825	\$104,773	1.888	R5
27-707-000-0071-00	06/16/23	\$179,900	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$179,900	\$28,645	\$151,255	\$75,241	2.010	R53
27-707-000-0014-00	03/01/24	\$175,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$175,000	\$28,311	\$146,689	\$70,095	2.093	R53
25-480-000-0006-00	09/22/23	\$219,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$219,000	\$23,328	\$195,672	\$88,839	2.203	R5

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R26 North Forest/Four Corners/Windwatch Condos

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
23-435-000-0006-00	04/13/22	\$260,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$260,000	\$44,744	\$215,256	\$189,361	1.137	R26
23-435-000-0009-00	12/08/23	\$260,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$260,000	\$44,744	\$215,256	\$183,819	1.171	R26
23-435-000-0027-00	08/15/22	\$250,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$250,000	\$44,744	\$205,256	\$157,265	1.305	R26
23-435-000-0016-00	08/01/23	\$299,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$299,000	\$44,744	\$254,256	\$171,682	1.481	R26
Totals:		\$1,069,000			\$1,069,000		\$890,024	\$702,127	E.C.F. => 1.268	
									Ave. E.C.F. => 1.273	

Indicated ECF of 1.268 was used.

repeat sale

23-435-000-0016-00	04/28/23	\$255,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENGTH	\$255,000	\$44,744	\$210,256	\$171,682	1.225	R26
--------------------	----------	-----------	----	-----------------	-----------	----------	-----------	-----------	-------	-----

City of North Muskegon ECF Analysis:

R27 - North Pier/Mills Ave Condos

Units Analyzed: City of North Muskegon; City of Muskegon; City of Norton Shores; City of Roosevelt Park

Dates Analyzed: 04/01/2022 - 03/31/2024

No sales in time frame - used ECF of 1.892. Consider condo sales in comparable cities below.

Parcel Number	Sale Date	Sale Price	Instr.	Terms of Sale	Adj. Sale \$	Land + Yard	Bldg. Residual	Cost Man. \$	E.C.F.	ECF Area
27-707-000-0053-00	03/08/24	\$160,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$160,000	\$28,706	\$131,294	\$71,802	1.829	R53
27-707-000-0094-00	06/09/23	\$165,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$165,000	\$23,706	\$141,294	\$76,792	1.840	R53
25-480-000-0013-00	08/25/23	\$218,999	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$218,999	\$15,242	\$203,757	\$108,265	1.882	R5
27-707-000-0105-00	03/18/24	\$157,500	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$157,500	\$28,645	\$128,855	\$68,047	1.894	R53
27-707-000-0062-00	05/05/23	\$153,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$153,000	\$23,569	\$129,431	\$68,048	1.902	R53
24-138-000-0201-00	10/18/22	\$225,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$225,000	\$7,500	\$217,500	\$113,080	1.923	R07.2
27-635-000-0019-00	10/28/22	\$325,000	WD	03-ARM'S LENG	\$325,000	\$32,437	\$292,563	\$151,944	1.925	R46
							\$1,244,694	\$657,978	1.892	
								average	1.885	
								median	1.894	