

MUSKEGON COUNTY PROPOSAL SUMMARY

Commodity Number: 946-12

Department: Human Resources

Proposal: RFP 13-2093

Release Date: 08/16/13

Product / Service: Actuarial Services

Opening Date: 09/13/13

MITN Solicitation Statistics
Vendors Received Notice: 42
Vendors Accessed Attachments: 23
Proposals Received: 3
No-Proposal Form Received: 0

Vendor Name & Address	2013 Review Fee	2014 Review Fee	2015 Review Fee	Optional On-Site Visit	Comments
Aon Risk Consultants, Inc. dba Aon Global Risk Consulting 200 E. Randolph Street Chicago, IL 60601	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$1,500.00	3 Yrs Renewal Option at Same Pricing
Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting Three Logan Square 1717 Arch Street, Suite 1100 Philadelphia, PA 19103	\$9,990.00	\$9,990.00	\$9,990.00	No Charge	
Pinnacle Actuarial Resources, Inc. 2817 Reed Road, Suite 2 Bloomington, IL 61704	\$12,500.00	\$12,500.00	\$12,500.00		

Department Recommendation:

Name of Witness: Tina Nash

Name of Buyer: Christine R. Johnson

Finance & Management Services Director Name: Heath Kaplan

Signature: _____

Vendor Awarded: _____

Board Approval Date: _____

Purchase Order Number: _____

RFP 13-2093 ACTUARIAL SERVICES

Vendor Evaluation Summary

Aon Risk Consultants, Inc.	Rater #1	Rater #2	Proposal Ranking Average	Overall Rating
Actuarial Firm Experience	225.0	225.0		
Staff Qualifications	225.0	225.0		
Sub-Contracting	90.0	100.0		
Special Knowledge	135.0	135.0		
Price	175.0	200.0		
Rating Total	850.0	885.0		
			867.5	3

Oliver Wyman Actuarial Consulting	Rater #1	Rater #2	Proposal Ranking Average	Overall Rating
Actuarial Firm Experience	225.0	225.0		
Staff Qualifications	225.0	225.0		
Sub-Contracting	90.0	100.0		
Special Knowledge	135.0	150.0		
Price	225.0	250.0		
Rating Total	900.0	950.0		
			925.0	1

Pinnacle Actuarial Resources, Inc.	Rater #1	Rater #2	Proposal Ranking Average	Overall Rating
Actuarial Firm Experience	225.0	200.0		
Staff Qualifications	225.0	225.0		
Sub-Contracting	90.0	100.0		
Special Knowledge	135.0	120.0		
Price	200.0	225.0		
Rating Total	875.0	870.0		
			872.5	2